

**NO CHOICE – NO GUIDANCE?**

**CAREER GUIDANCE POLICIES  
IN EU NEIGHBOURING COUNTRIES**

# No choice – no guidance ?

## Career Guidance Policies in EU Neighbouring Countries

Helmut Zelloth<sup>1</sup> (ETF)

**Summary:** The need and demand for career guidance services in EU neighbouring countries is huge and seems to be on the rise. An ETF analysis has identified a number of push and pull factors shaping the demand for career guidance in EU neighbouring countries. It also revealed several contextual features that act as barriers to career guidance development, such as the large informal economy, the tradition of informal guidance and in general more limited choices. The article further introduces examples of policies and interesting practice that are being adopted in order to respond to demand. Whereas career guidance development in some countries remains ‘donor-driven’ or ‘donor-dependent’, other countries have opted for a ‘home-grown’ developmental pattern. The level of policy-profile varies amongst EU neighbouring countries and the most frequent delivery models being adopted are the ‘centre-model’ and the ‘curriculum-model’. There is an enormous potential to learn from other neighbouring countries as well as from the experience of European Union member states and to utilize the stock of European tools and instruments for career guidance.

### 1. IN DEMAND – CAREER GUIDANCE IN EU NEIGHBOURING COUNTRIES

- 1.1 **Career guidance is moving up the policy agenda.** There is plenty of evidence that career guidance is moving up the policy agenda and that guidance services are developing in many neighbouring countries of the European Union in recent years. This phenomenon is true for countries in the Mediterranean region, such as Egypt, Jordan, Syria, Morocco and even West Bank and Gaza, for countries in the Western Balkans and South-East European area (Montenegro, Kosovo, Turkey), as well as for countries of the former Soviet Union (e.g. Ukraine, Georgia). The reasons for this trend are manifold and can be largely explained by economic and labour market developments, as a result of ongoing education and training reforms, and by other policy-induced drivers, such as the increasing awareness of and involvement in EU employment education/training policies. The latter argument is particularly relevant for candidate and potential candidate countries to the European Union.
- 1.2 **The level of policy-profile varies across countries.** Until quite recently, in a group of countries (Albania, Georgia, Egypt, Syria, West Bank and Gaza) career guidance has not been on the policy agenda at all. This ‘policy-absenteeism’ in career guidance is now being gradually replaced by a remedial policy model or in some cases even by a comprehensive strategic approach. Other countries, such as the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia or Croatia had some policies on career guidance in place, but they tended to be rhetorical, fragmented and not to be significantly enforced

---

<sup>1</sup> Helmut Zelloth is a Senior Human Capital Development Specialist at the ETF – European Training Foundation (an agency of the European Union), based in Turin/Italy; email: hze@etf.europa.eu.

(‘Low-policy-profile’ countries). In another group of countries (e.g. Turkey, Montenegro, Kosovo, Ukraine, Jordan, Morocco), career guidance has been featuring high on the policy agenda already for some time and in some cases policies have been recently reinforced or implementation is characterised by innovative approaches or large scale projects (‘High-policy-profile’ countries).

- 1.3 **Strategic policy frameworks are emerging.**<sup>2</sup> In the last years, a couple of countries have been preparing policy frameworks for career guidance. The Ministry of Education in Jordan has adopted a ‘National Strategy of Vocational Orientation’. Kosovo has approved a 10-Year-Career Guidance Strategy (2006-2015), initiated by the three major ministries involved in guidance (Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare and Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports). The strategy views career guidance as an essential component of lifelong learning and aims to establish all-age guidance services for Kosovo in the long-term. In addition, a curriculum-framework for career education concerning the grades 6-13 is under preparation. Also a few other countries are currently preparing similar policy frameworks for career guidance (Egypt has started in 2007 and the West Bank/Gaza Strip most recently in 2008). Some countries opted for introducing references to career guidance in specific legislation that was being prepared (e.g. Georgia in the VET Law 2007); in Lebanon, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education has recently developed a National Education Strategy, in which career guidance is a priority.
- 1.4 **Policy co-ordination is increasingly viewed as essential.** Policy co-ordination within the education sector as well as at cross-sector level between education and the labour and employment administration, remains a challenge. As a result of a ‘segmented’ approach to policy making in career guidance, nearly all countries have developed separate structures in the education and employment sectors, with policies and operations not effectively co-ordinated. This ‘fault line’ that divides the career development field like a ‘tectonic plate’ (Fretwell, Plant 2001) seems to be true for both smaller and larger EU neighbouring countries. Some countries have acknowledged this problem and attempted to find policy responses and develop co-ordination mechanisms; others not yet. In Ukraine, for example, the Vice-Prime Minister has issued a special Edict on guidance in 2007, in which the Ministries concerned, key stakeholders, providers and universities were called to improve synergies, co-operation and co-ordination in career guidance. In Morocco co-ordination between different ministries has been regulated by a Ministerial Note, though the process tends to be top-heavy and bureaucratic (Sultana, Watts 2007). Egypt has created a ‘Voluntary National Task Force’ on career guidance in 2007, initiated jointly by the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Manpower and Migration, in order to prepare a concept paper and strategic document on career guidance. This Task Force was subsequently formalised and broadened its membership to other Ministries and stakeholders in 2009. Kosovo has set up a National Policy Forum in 2006, based on a Memorandum of Understanding signed by the three line ministries. The composition of this Policy Forum is somewhat remarkable, as it managed to get high level officials committed to be

---

<sup>2</sup> This article is largely based on an ETF publication on demand for career guidance in EU neighbouring countries (Zelloth 2009). It additionally draws on ETF field visits to a number of countries as well as on information and analysis provided by 28 country reviews and three major comparative analyses the ETF has undertaken since 2002: a cross-country analysis of career guidance policies in 11 Acceding and Candidate countries (Prof. Ronald Sultana), in 7 Western Balkan countries (Prof. Richard Sweet) and in 10 Mediterranean (MEDA) countries/territories (Prof. Tony Watts, Prof. Ronald Sultana).

members of this body (Directors/Head of Departments from three ministries and few other stakeholders). In Turkey, the Ministries of National Education, Labour and Social Security, the public employment services and social partners, as well as the State Planning Agency, the Higher Education Board and statistical institute, have agreed on a renewed “Protocol for Cooperation in Career Information, Guidance and Counseling Services” in 2004, which was further specified in a new ‘Memorandum of Understanding’ in 2009.

## 2. THE CONTEXT OF DEMAND FOR CAREER GUIDANCE IN EU NEIGHBOURING COUNTRIES

The issue of demand for career guidance services in EU neighbouring countries – as well as other low- and middle-income countries - is not well researched. In general, direct empirical evidence of demand is either lacking or not sufficiently developed to support evidence-based policy making. For the majority of countries, in particular the smaller states, this has to be seen in a wider context where science and research are largely carried out under modest conditions and with minimum funding. Consequently, overall research in education, training and labour market institutions is very limited.

2.1 ***Empirical evidence of demand for career guidance.*** In Ukraine, an institute within the Academy of Pedagogical Sciences has carried out some applied research on guidance during the last decade, but it focused on supply issues and its research results seem to be rather institutionally isolated and not linked to policy making. The only country where research on guidance within universities is beginning to emerge is Turkey, with a research centre on Human Resources Management and Career Counselling being planned at Ankara University’s Faculty of Political Sciences. In Montenegro, a first demand-focused survey was undertaken by the newly established Centre for Career Information and Professional Counselling in 2007. A basic questionnaire on demand for career guidance (sample of 800 primary school students), showed as results that around 1/3 of pupils in the last grade were still undecided on the type of educational progression, and around 30 % expressed lack of information. Another needs assessment survey was done by the University of Prishtina in Kosovo in 2007, based on a random sample of 726 university students, prior to the opening of a Student Service Centre. It demonstrated that almost 90% of students find it relevant to have such a centre giving information and advising on issues regarding not only academic studies but also careers.<sup>3</sup> A most recent tracer study in Kosovo undertaken by Swisscontact in 2008 revealed that almost 88% of VET graduates were currently not employed in the profession they were trained for but that 92% would like to work most in the same profession for which they were trained. 93% intended to change their job as soon as they found something else, and 85% did not make any contact with institutions assisting to find a job.<sup>4</sup> A recent analysis in Turkey (method of Participatory Labour Market Assessment – PLMA) revealed amongst the most important challenges identified by youth

---

<sup>3</sup> Student Services Centre LINK, *Needs assessment survey*, University of Prishtina, April 2007. The Student Services Centre considers the sample of the survey as representative for active students at the University of Prishtina. 65% of respondents to the survey were in the age group below 20 and 30% in the group between 21-25 years of age. 54% of participants in the survey were males.

<sup>4</sup> Swisscontact, *Tracerstudy on VET graduates*, Unofficial draft, Swisscontact, Prishtina, 2008. The study analysed the situation of VET graduates from 8 technical schools and one economic VET school. From 593 graduates registered in the tracing system, 410 were interviewed, from which 242 continued their education and 168 entered into the labour market. The follow-up results reflect the situation of 168 graduates who entered in the labour market.

in the transition from school to work 'the lack of information about job availability' (19% of respondents) and the 'lack of jobs' (25%). Inadequate or irrelevant school preparation was cited by 43% as the most serious challenge.<sup>5</sup>

- 2.2 ***Indirect and 'non-evidential' sources of demand for career guidance.*** In view of the weak direct empirical evidence of demand for career guidance, potential demand largely needs to be argued and derived 'indirectly' from wider development patterns and 'non-evidential' sources. A number of drivers of demand can be identified through analysis of the inner logic and development features of the labour market and education systems as well as other contextual specificities of EU neighbouring countries. As the main push-and pull-factors shaping and fostering the demand for career guidance in these countries, in the following can be considered:
- 2.3 ***Economic transition and accelerated growth.*** Many of the EU neighbouring countries (in particular Eastern Europe, Western Balkans) had to cope with sudden events of economic transition and started to move from planned to market economies only less than 20 years ago. The early phase of transition was characterised by economic downturn and labour markets became highly volatile and non-transparent. In the last few years, nearly all the countries have showed higher growth rates and greater economic dynamism compared to EU and OECD countries, and labour demand has been growing. Whereas in the context of early transition the scope for guidance was limited, potential demand has been increasing in the context of more stabilised and now fast expanding economies. In a few countries, a direct link between economic development and the raised importance of career guidance on the policy agenda can be observed. In Ukraine, when two major career guidance initiatives 'failed' in the mid-1990s, this was explained by local experts and stakeholders as being due to the 'non-readiness' of the economy and labour market at that time.
- 2.4 ***Labour market mismatch and structural unemployment.*** A number of countries show a significant mismatch between demand and supply of the labour force, as one of the factors attributed to high unemployment rates. This is true for the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia as acknowledged by its National Employment strategy 2010, as well as for Montenegro, where the tourism and construction sectors hire tens of thousands seasonal workers from foreign countries, despite high unemployment. In Egypt, unemployment is increasing and is comparatively high for intermediate and higher qualifications rather than for the low skilled. Ukraine is currently facing severe labour market supply deficiencies and a major mismatch in terms of 'undersupply' of skilled and manual workers in almost all sectors to satisfy the needs of the 'booming' economy. One of the traditional functions of career guidance, to contribute to a better 'matching' of supply and demand of labour, seems to be particularly relevant for the neighbouring countries of the EU.
- 2.5 ***Growing emphasis on preventive labour market policy and social inclusion.*** Active labour market policies as well as employment services have been traditionally poorly developed in a number of countries but have been gaining ground in recent years. Egypt, with bilateral donor support from

---

<sup>5</sup> World Bank, *Investing in Turkey's Next Generation: The School-to-Work Transition and Turkey's Development*, Draft report prepared by the World Bank, Consultation version, World Bank, Washington, D.C., December 2007.

Canada (CIDA), has started to reform its employment services, for the first time introducing active measures, including guidance. The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia has introduced an individual approach (Individual Action Plan) towards the unemployed in 2007, and guidance and training are considered part of it. Montenegro, which has introduced Individual Action Plans already in 2001, fuels demand for career guidance services through specific objectives and targets in the National Employment Strategy and its Action Plans, when aiming to increase the number of clients or the accessibility of information, for example. A 'paradoxical' exception is Georgia, which abolished public employment services and both active measures and unemployment benefits to the unemployed in 2006.

- 2.6 ***Modernisation of the education system and increasing diversity and flexibility of learning opportunities.*** Changing the structure of the education system, for example by introducing two- or three-tier cycles in traditionally monolithic primary education, as currently is happening both in Montenegro and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, can also boost demand for career guidance. So can the introduction of an 'orientation year' as in Kosovo, Albania and Turkey. In Egypt, a new study plan for technical vocational education and training was adopted in 2007, to be implemented in 2008/09. It aims to postpone the decision for specialisation in TVET from the 1<sup>st</sup> to the 2<sup>nd</sup> year, thus creating potential demand for the provision of orientation programmes and other guidance activities. Before, in general secondary education elective subject matters were introduced in Egypt, and as a result, 'academic counsellors' were appointed to assist students in selecting the academic subjects that would match their career aspirations. In Ukraine, secondary education has been extended from 11 to 12 years (the first school leavers of the 12<sup>th</sup> year will graduate in 2013). In Montenegro, policy makers are thinking about making secondary education compulsory and VET more modularised on the mid-term. In Ukraine, the Confederation of Employers has started to promote a system of flexible and short-term labour market oriented vocational training.
- 2.7 ***Policies to reduce drop-out.*** Preventing wrong choices and reducing or eliminating the number of drop-outs at various stages of the education system, with a view to minimise the 'waste' or wrong use of educational investments, is one of the functions career guidance can contribute to in principle. In Kosovo drop-out levels are known to be very high: one in two youngster leaves school before turning 18 and two out of three youngsters leave the education system without any qualification (ETF country analysis, 2008). Increasing access and enrolment is one of the highest priorities for Kosovo's education system. The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia had a comparatively high drop-out rate during primary education and at the stage of transition from primary to secondary schools, with almost 17% of pupils not continuing education, thus 'reproducing' the low educational level of the population. Also of concern is the number of pupils leaving the education system in Georgia upon completion of compulsory schooling without professional training.
- 2.8 ***Push factors from the supply side.*** The supply-driven introduction of (pilot) career guidance services, if successfully implemented, can have the effect of stimulating and fuelling further demand for guidance. For example, the establishment of 'career centres' in some VET schools in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia has further stimulated demand in other VET schools (meanwhile at 57 schools established such career centres) and could trigger

higher demand beyond students of VET schools, for example students in gymnasia, which are often located in the same building as VET schools. In the long term – and in combination with the new two- or three-tier primary education cycles – this could also place peer pressure on primary education to start or enhance its provision of services. Much the same might happen in Georgia, with the recent introduction of career managers and consultants in VET Centres. In Kosovo, the piloting of career education in the 9<sup>th</sup> grade ('orientation year') in 2008 has triggered off additional demand by other classes located in the same 35 schools in which the pilot took place. In Montenegro there are signs that the foundation of a CIPS (Centre for Information and Professional Counselling) in the capital of Montenegro (Podgorica) has created further demand in the regions, via information, surveys and awareness rising on the topic.

- 2.9 ***Policy induced drivers of demand.*** Other drivers might steer additional demand for career guidance, such as 'Policy beliefs' (e.g. it is believed or hoped that career guidance contributes to increase employability and educational efficiency), 'Intuitive policy statements' and 'policy activism' (e.g. 'It's the right time now to start with career guidance') can be observed in some countries. The EU integration process functions in particular for candidate countries, but also for potential candidates, as an important driver of demand. Through gradually increasing involvement in the EU policy developments in employment and education, but also through the attitude of policy makers to anticipate EU expectations and demand in the hope of getting earlier to accession, the likelihood is high that some countries will take into account sooner rather than later the EU Council Resolution on Lifelong Guidance of 2004 and the new Council Resolution on 'Better integrating lifelong guidance into lifelong learning strategies' adopted by the Ministers of Education of 27 EU member states in 2008.

### 3. BARRIERS TO MEETING THE DEMAND

In parallel to the manifold 'drivers' of demand for career guidance in EU neighbouring countries as argued above, there need to be considered a number of specific limitations, which tend to undermine the potential demand and effectiveness of current guidance services. Such factors and barriers arise from the different stage of economic development, the nature of labour markets and the countries' education and training systems as well as socio-cultural specificities. They all tend to limit individual choices of students and citizens (no choice – no guidance?). A few of these features can be further elaborated as follows:

- 3.1 ***High share of informal economy.*** A distinctive feature of nearly all EU neighbouring countries is the comparatively high share of the informal or 'shadow' economy. Estimates of informal employment in Albania, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Egypt range between 50-55% for each of the countries. The shadow economy in Georgia is estimated to constitute more than 2/3 of the GDP and in Ukraine some 30-50 % of total economic activities. As a result, the official employment rates tend to be very low in a number of countries, limiting the potential scope for career guidance. Moreover, the informal sector by definition does not fall within the conventional purview of formal guidance services. Therefore, in countries with a high share of informal economy, formal guidance services are challenged by and need to consider both the informal labour market and the 'informal

guidance' provision (often based on 'social capital'), when shaping formal structures and systems.

- 3.2 ***Social capital versus human capital.*** As a result of the large share of the 'informal' and 'survival economy' but also due to different socio-cultural features, such as the important role of the family and informal networking in such societies, there are other labour allocation mechanisms involved or even prevalent than those based on merit and performance in order to get access to interesting, well-paid and/or secure jobs and careers. An earlier ETF study (Sultana/Watts, 2007) confirms such features for the Mediterranean region: 'Whom you know tends to be more important than what you know.' Connections with and through (wider) family, friends and other non-transparent forms are crucial for 'managing a career'. Some empirical evidence on Kosovo - although not necessarily transferable to other EU neighbouring countries - stems from the earlier mentioned tracer study on VET graduates who entered the labour market. Its results showed that almost everybody in recent employment (97%) got their job through 'personal relations' and 50% saw 'to migrate abroad' as the best alternative to finding a job (Swisscontact 2008).
- 3.3 ***Dominance of 'informal guidance'.*** Hand in hand with informal labour allocation mechanisms goes the phenomenon of 'informal guidance', which is 'delivered' through parents, family, friends and other peers. It represents another major obstacle for formal guidance provision to get established or to become more effective. However, the fact that 'informal' guidance exists, indicates that there is potential demand for 'formal' and professional guidance services. The rationality of 'Informal guidance' also may be questioned since it often seems to be neither effective from the individual or from the labour market perspective and may lead to individual disappointment, waste of human resources and fostering labour market mismatch.
- 3.4 ***Affordability of career guidance.*** Despite the fact that most EU neighbouring countries are developing their economies and even showed higher growth rates than the EU in recent years, their economies still remain at a considerably lower developmental level than the EU average. This poses the question of affordability of career guidance in countries such as Kosovo, whose annual per capita income was estimated at 1,100 Euro in 2006. In many countries overall resources (public and private) are limited and in the fierce competition for resources, 'hardware' investments tend to come first before 'software'. The lack of resources is partly compensated by the permanent and sometimes high inflow of funds from international and bilateral donors, including the EU, towards their education and labour market sectors. Some of these funding portions have been allocated to career guidance development and there is still more potential to un-tap. In principle, low- and middle-income countries will need to embark on cost-efficient approaches, such as putting the emphasis on career information, career education, self-help and web-based approaches. But, if the costs of the 'wrong choices' of young people were calculated, these would by far outnumber the magnitude of any investments in career guidance.
- 3.5 ***'Shadow' education system, selectivity and academic orientation.*** In a number of EU neighbouring countries the phenomenon of private tutoring is so enormous that one could almost speak about a 'shadow education system'. This is particularly true for Turkey, Egypt and other Mediterranean countries. Estimates show that the large majority of students attend private

courses in the evenings or weekends, mainly in order to have higher chances to manage successfully the university entrance exam, which in turn decides about the future careers. In general, this private tutoring system does not only compensate learning which did not take place in schools for several reasons, but tutoring institutes are particularly specialised to prepare students on those techniques which are required to manage or navigate through the exam and its complicated scoring system. Teachers of private tutoring companies often have an important 'informal' or even formal guidance role. There is evidence from Egypt that even poor families are ready to pay for their kids private tutoring out of their last resources. Due to the overall 'gear' towards academic and higher education largely steered by social and often unrealistic expectations, in many countries vocational education and training has been developed into a low-status alternative to higher and general secondary education, which poses an additional challenge for career guidance. For the Mediterranean countries, Watts/Sultana (2007) have confirmed that for example, the culture of elitism and selectivity or current assessment strategies tends to affect negatively the scope for career guidance, jeopardising the very notion of educational guidance.

- 3.6 **Historical legacy.** A specific feature that is more typical for post-communist EU neighbouring countries is the historical legacy of a dualistic pattern of state (reliance/obedience) versus individual (empowerment), emphasising the first feature. Individualistic notions as well as the term 'career' were long time regarded as a social vice and might still act as 'mental barriers' against career guidance. Similar experience was identified in new member states of the EU such as Romania or Bulgaria, that previously belonged to the 'Eastern block' but where historical legacies and negative connotations with the term 'career guidance' or 'professional orientation' were still present a few years ago (Zelloth, Visser et al 2007).

#### 4. DELIVERY MODELS OF CAREER GUIDANCE IN EU NEIGHBOURING COUNTRIES

In the attempt, to meeting the rising demand for career guidance services, in particular for young people in transition phases, EU neighbouring countries have adopted different approaches and delivery models.

- 4.1 **Home-grown versus donor-driven career guidance development.** Apparently some countries seem to follow a rather 'donor-driven' developmental approach and other countries more tend to follow a 'home-grown' pattern of career guidance development. To the first group belongs the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, which had received support to career guidance as a component of two subsequent EU CARDS VET projects (2000-2003). However, two major innovations in the area of career guidance amongst them the development of a 'Model for Professional Counselling and Mediation for Employment' (see graph 1), did not prove to be sustainable after external funding finished. To the group of 'home-grown' (policy) development would belong Ukraine and Montenegro. Both countries have not been subject of donor-support on career guidance in the last decade and have been following their own development paths, drawing at best on some experience from their 'neighbours' (Russia, Slovenia). Although the level of ownership might be higher in the home-grown model, its sustainability is not necessarily guaranteed. In Ukraine, for example, career guidance policy has been quite volatile in the last decade, establishing and then abolishing

centres in the PES and at university, recently now possibly re-introducing again such centres. Although a donor-driven approach bears a certain higher risk of non-sustainability as well as of a certain 'bias' in 'policy and practice borrowing', often shaped by the geographical origin of the donor or the implementing consultants, external funding is highly necessary or even inevitably for most EU neighbouring countries.

### **Graph 1 – Example of failed innovation in career guidance policy in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia**

<p><b>Model for Professional Counselling and Mediation for Employment</b></p> <p>In the frame of an EU CARDS VET II project component (2002/2003), a working group, comprising both representatives from the education and employment sector, developed a 'Draft Model for Professional Counselling and Mediation for Employment' in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia. This model outlined the principles, goals and functions of career guidance in the country and also pointed out some questions and dilemmas, such as 'who should be responsible for career counselling' or 'who will be leading the process'. A couple of years later, however, this document was not known (anymore) by both (new) policy makers and practitioners and the related tool developed ('Instrument for monitoring the students' counselling in secondary VET schools') has never been implemented, apart from a few active pilot schools that continued the project on their own initiative.</p> <p>Amongst the possible reasons identified why this model was never implemented or followed-up, were that the results produced by an expert group were not sufficiently communicated to the policy making level. Moreover, a clear leadership was lacking amongst the institutions involved, and the capacities and commitment of key actors had been overestimated during the project, but in reality were too low, also due to missing incentives.</p>
---

In reality there are a number of examples of sustainable donor-support projects as well as of mixed-models where home-grown development is complemented by donor-funding. In Jordan, Canadian donor-support (CIDA) initiated career guidance development through the 'Al-Manar' project, which is now continuing autonomously, since donor-support was successfully built upon a strategic lever (the National Centre for Human Resources Development), which in turn became a national 'driver' for career guidance development. In Turkey, German bilateral assistance has supported the development of public employment services in the last decade and a World Bank loan now supports the further development of career guidance in the education system (strengthening co-operation mechanisms, establishing a National Career Information System). Montenegro will receive for the first time EU IPA support in 2009/10 to further expand their model of career centres and to develop a national strategy for lifelong guidance.

- 4.2. ***Different approaches and delivery models of career guidance.*** The most frequent delivery models being adopted in EU neighbouring countries are the 'centre-model' (both in educational and labour market settings) and the 'curriculum-model'. In reality, sometimes two models are combined and the curriculum model seems to be on the rise. Virtual or web-based models are not yet common. Regarding the delivery methods, the 'psychological model'

appears to be still dominant, but the emerging 'pedagogical model' or a 'hybrid model' gain ground. As a preferred method of introducing and gradually developing guidance services, piloting has been used in many countries. The ways how basic development patterns (home-grown versus donor-driven) influence and are interrelated with the different types of models and methods that are being adopted, still needs to be further explored.

- 4.3. **The 'Centre' model.** In a number of countries a model is being applied in both educational and labour market settings that could be classified as the 'centre-model'. Hereby, the notion, meaning and magnitude of a 'centre' can vary substantially, from a 'virtual centre' to a 'one-man-show' or up to a centre in a classical understanding, staffed with several professionals. The 'National Guidance and Resource Centre' in Kosovo (Prishtina) has no full-time staff and works on the basis of 'staff-loans' and temporary staff assignments from three ministries', who are rather 'semi-specialists'. The 'Centre for Information and Professional Counselling' in Montenegro (Podgorica) is built on two full-time staff, one of them psychologist, the other information expert. The centre, located in the PES, can also link and 'draw' on other specialists from the public employment services, if necessary.

#### **Graph 2 – Example of a 'Centre-model' as innovation in the career guidance system in Montenegro**

**CIPS**  
**Centres for Information and Professional Counselling**  
*(Centar za informisanje / profesionalno savjetovanje)*

The first CIPS was established in February 2007 at the initiative of the National Employment Agency of Montenegro and the Local Employment Bureau in Podgorica, exclusively with national funds and to a certain extent modelled on the Slovenian example. It has been a 'home-grown' and not 'donor-driven' process so far. Its basic idea is to introduce a **one-stop-shop** (all information at one place), with a strong **career information** function, in particular for **young people**, who need information on the possibilities of education, training and employment requirements of specific occupations and compatibility of their characteristics and abilities with those requirements.

Although the main target groups are in particular young people (students, unemployed) the Centre aims also to cater **for all citizens** in Montenegro (unemployed, employed, employers) with regard to creating quality services for **career information and advice**, but also counselling and selection.

It also aims to establish a light **methodological function** to support guidance practitioners (employment counsellors, school psychologists) and to undertake surveys and research on demand and supply of guidance. It has established contacts and co-operation with a wide range of key stakeholders in guidance in the country (eg Ministry of Education and Science, Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, Chamber of Commerce, University of Montenegro, Centre for Development of NGOs).

There are further plans to expand this model by establishing a number of local CIPS in Montenegro (another one has already been founded in Herzeg Novi in 2007 and a third one was under preparation at the Local Employment Bureau of Bar in 2008). The expansion of CIPS to other regions and other activities in career guidance will be supported by an EU IPA project in 2009/10.

The career centres at VET schools in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia are not staffed at all, but provide 'room' for guidance and are managed somewhat cost-efficiently by the student organisation and a teacher who voluntarily performs a certain co-ordination role. The innovative aspects of the 'centre model' applied in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia are the approach of fostering students' self-help and own initiative in career development, combined with the partial use of key competences and the tasting and exploratory approach towards the world of work. This model has potential to be extended (it has already expanded to all VET schools, which was not foreseen at the beginning of this project) to general secondary schools, since many of these are in the same buildings as VET schools. Ownership is comparatively high, since the centres are 'run' also by the users (student organisation) in co-operation with the career co-ordinator, who is usually a teacher or school psychologist.

**Graph 3 – Example of a 'Centre-model' as innovation in the career guidance system in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia**

**Career Centres in VET schools  
and Supervised Occupational Experience Program  
(Centre za Kariera)**

An USAID funded project (SEA – Secondary School Activity) included a Career Development Component (2005-2007), aiming to provide students with leadership skills, personal growth and work-based experience, in order to help them be better prepared for employment. This component has established gradually in all 57 VET schools in Macedonia a 'career centre', which is basically a meeting room assigned for students for a few hours per day for the purpose of career development. USAID has provided the most necessary **equipment** for the functioning of the centre (including printed and audio/video materials necessary for research and student's career development). A **VET student organisation** (MASSUM) was founded which has the co-ownership of this 'centre', in co-operation with a **school teacher** (who can be any subject teacher, but has to undergo some training) who has been given the additional position of '**career coordinator**' in the school. The teachers met showed considerable motivation although they were not paid for this task. Instructional **guides and manuals** have been developed by local consultants and training is provided in **job searching techniques, CV and interview preparation**, attending for an interview, and public speaking.

In most schools, teachers have started to incorporate various parts of materials as supplements to existing curriculum, thus avoiding the need for major revisions of the curricula. Strengthening the links among the schools, the companies and other social partners is also one of the objectives. The purpose is to better inform the students about the labour market, with relevant information and assistance directed towards improved career development.

The SEA project also has initiated a new activity called the **Supervised Occupational Experience programme – SOE**. Its main goal is to provide students with opportunity for work-based learning directly in the industry. The SOE programme consists of planned activities designed to gain hands-on experience and develop skills in specific career areas. One form of SOE, the *Exploratory SOE*, is designed primarily to help students **to become aware of possible careers in specific clusters**. Examples of exploratory SOE activities might include observing of workers and becoming familiar with their tasks and responsibilities. Records are kept by the students.

Georgia provides another example of a 'centre-model' as an innovation in career guidance. The Czech Republic, Poland and the International Organisation for Migration (IOM) support a pilot 'Information, Job Counselling and Referral Centre' which is aiming to foster labour market integration and social inclusion goals. The professional cadre of the Centre is composed of a mix of specialists of the labour market and career guidance (labour economists, sociologists and psychologists) who are working in an interdisciplinary approach. The Centre has also a certain 'compensatory function' to cater for the unemployed since public employment services were abolished in Georgia by the government in 2006.

#### **Graph 4 – Example of a 'Centre-model' as innovation in the career guidance system in Georgia**

##### **Information, Job Counselling and Referral Centre (IJCRC)**

The establishment of a Job Counselling and Referral Centre (2007) in the capital of Georgia, Tbilisi, is a pilot action which is planned to be expanded to a network all over Georgia, in particular in regions with high unemployment. Demand for its services seem to be high.

The aim of the Centre is to develop and apply efficient **job counselling and referral mechanisms** to serve the reintegration needs of the Georgian migrants returning voluntarily to their country from different destinations in Europe. Other targets groups are potential migrants, but also the population of Georgia in search of jobs in general. The Centre sees its benefit as a valuable component in the chain of **sustainable reintegration**, providing the beneficiaries with better understanding of how to plan their future in their own country.

The pilot Centre elaborates **methodological materials** (printed and electronic versions, training tool-kit, CDs, flyers, brochures with **information** on the Centre and on employment and training possibilities). A labour market survey is being conducted on skills required by employers and available trainings to match those skills. It also implements a number of **capacity building** activities, such as staff training and methodology provision to the staff of the VET sector of the Ministry of Education and Science.

When the Centre is fully operational, the provision of referral services will be **piloted** to the project beneficiaries in employment and/or self-employment by the Centre. At a later stage, the Centre aims to provide a full range of job counselling services for adults, including professional and personal skill assessment, information on training, retraining and employment opportunities, help in establishing one's career goals, advice on choosing the right occupation,

In the pilot phase the Centre will serve at least 50 beneficiaries in searching or enhancing their job opportunities. Both **returning migrants and potential migrants are a priority group** to receive career guidance ('professional orientation') services as well as to utilise the information on existing retraining and employment opportunities.

The Centre aims to become a reliable partner of the Georgian government and the International Organisation for Migration (IOM). Funding from the Czech Ministry of Interior through the Development Cooperation Programme and from the Polish Government through the International Polish Aid Programme enables the Centre to offer its services free of charge to job seekers and potential employers alike.

- 4.4. **The 'Curriculum' model.** A few countries have introduced or started to introduce career education and/or curricular principles related to guidance. The most pronounced example can be found in Turkey, and the most recent developments are taking place in Kosovo and Albania. In Turkey, career guidance is included as part of class guidance programs in all types of school, integrated with personal and social education. For all grades of secondary education, compulsory class guidance programs have been introduced in order to ensure congruity in terms of class/group activities to be performed by class guidance teachers in weekly guidance hours and to prevent the use of these hours for other purposes. Teacher handbooks were introduced in 2000/01 to guide teachers through in-class activities in 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> and 11<sup>th</sup> grades; support is also offered by the school's guidance counselor(s). On average, half of the guidance program and handbooks cover educational and career guidance topics and activities (Akkok 2006). A few years ago, the duration of all secondary education programs was increased to 4 years and VET and general secondary education programs got a common base in the 9<sup>th</sup> grade ('orientation year'), allowing for higher flexibility. In this context, an "Information and Guidance" class has been implemented recently (supported by the EU project MEGEP/SVET - Strengthening Vocational Education and Instruction Project) to inform students about the different types of education, occupations, sectors and working life.

In the Egyptian basic education, a subject matter named 'Practical fields' (2 hours per week) is part of the education plan and compulsory from grade 7 to grade 9. It aims at giving students a glance about fields other than the academic ones and to help them assess their own interest and capabilities as well as knowing about possible work opportunities. However, shortage of qualified teachers for this subject and the fact that many schools work in two daily shifts usually results in using these teaching hours for other purposes and academic classes. (Badawi 2006).

In 2005, the Ministry of Education in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia has issued an ordinance to schools, which provides the opportunity to include in the so-called 'free school activities' (2 hours per week) new elective 'subjects' such as entrepreneurship and career guidance. The extent to which this opportunity has been used in secondary and VET schools is not known.. But it is evident that in VET schools – due to career centres established in 2006 – some use of career education and guidance has been made of this new extra-curricular activity.

In Ukraine, 'labour lessons' in a separate subject 'Occupations of Today' from the 5<sup>th</sup> grade onwards and continuing from 9<sup>th</sup> to 11<sup>th</sup> grade (and 12<sup>th</sup> grade when the new structure of the school system becomes operational), may contain some elements of career guidance. In addition, the curricular 'class-teacher hours' (one hour per week) may be used for career guidance in theory, but it is rarely the case in practice. As in many other countries, this is complemented by other career guidance activities, such as invitations by universities to learn about their study programmes and invitations by the public employment services. In Ukraine, the latter takes a more frequent form (from one to three times per year in a region) and such job placement fairs are starting from the 9<sup>th</sup> grade onwards. Staff from the PES estimated that more than half of the student population is covered by this instrument.

In Kosovo, career education has been introduced as a pilot in the 9<sup>th</sup> grade (orientation year) in 34 schools all over the country in 2007/2008. This EU supported initiative was based on an earlier National Curriculum Framework (2001), which referred to career guidance as being relevant for all levels of education.

### Graph 5 – Example of a ‘Curriculum-model’ as innovation in the career guidance system in Kosovo

#### Career Education in Kosovo in the 9<sup>th</sup> grade (orientation year)

A larger EU funded project (CARDS Kosvet 3) supporting the development of vocational education and training in Kosovo, included a Career Guidance Component (2006-2008), aiming to establish a National Career Guidance Resource Centre (NCGRC) and to **pilot career education in the 9<sup>th</sup> grade (orientation year)**. The pilot was implemented in 34 schools throughout the country and took place from January to April 2008. In each pilot school at least one 9<sup>th</sup> grade class participated in the pilot (some schools had more classes who wished to participate on their own) and in total 16 teaching hours were delivered per class in one semester. Career education was taught as an **elective subject** and did not cause any major additional costs since it was taken as one of the four elective subjects each school can autonomously opt for. It was **delivered by subject teachers** who were interested in guidance and who got some training on career guidance prior to the pilot.

A recent **evaluation of the project** confirmed that the pilot can be considered a success story in terms of implementation as well as lessons learned for further improvement. It showed positive results and high satisfaction on both the teachers’ and students’ side with the new subject and **triggered off additional demand** even by classes which were not covered by the pilot in the same schools. One of the success factors was the dedication and commitment by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, which also decided to continue and extend the pilot in 2008/09. Meanwhile, shortcomings of the first pilot phase are being addressed through different measures in order to **improving the quality of career education** in the next piloting phase and to prepare for mainstreaming in a couple of years. Amongst these are additional teacher training, improving the material base for teachers and students, clearer funding arrangements, exploring synergies with entrepreneurship education.

In parallel, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology in the frame of the EU CARDS Kosvet 3 project is preparing a **curriculum framework** for career guidance concerning the grades 6 to 13 in schools in Kosovo.

Providing the current investment of 16 teaching hours per year for career education in pilot schools, career education can be considered as cost efficient approach. A rough calculation of the total costs of teaching (based on the average teacher salary in Kosovo) seems to make up less than 60 Euro per year per pilot-class (school), or in other terms approximately 2 Euro per pupil per year. As a result of the piloting, discussions have emerged on whether career education should be moved up from an elective subject to a compulsory one in the 9th grade (orientation year), as the risk is high that career education as an elective subject might be ‘crowded out’ by other subjects due to bad practices that appear to exist (e.g. ‘peer pressure’ from teachers of ‘strong subjects’, using elective subject hours for compulsory subjects, preferably maths and languages).

## 5. CHALLENGES AND OUTLOOK FOR THE FUTURE

5.1 Despite the different stages of development of EU neighbouring countries, they all face a number of common challenges in career guidance policy and practice. Amongst the **multiple challenges** for future development are the following:

(a) to consider both the informal labour market and informal guidance provision when shaping new career guidance services, due to the high share of the informal economy and also to the influence of specific allocation mechanisms in the education system and the labour market, present in the EU neighbouring countries;

(b) to adopt a cost-efficient approach in career guidance such as putting the emphasis on career information, career education, self-help and web-based approaches, networking and synergies between different providers and initiatives and to use untapped potential through shifting from a psychological approach to pedagogical or hybrid approaches;

(c) to transform policy into practice and to ensure sustainability of career guidance development by overcoming the barriers for implementation of policies (limited capacities, lack of specialists and resources) and through mechanisms for sustainability to be built into projects (ownership and leadership, effective resource planning, capacity building of the career guidance profession) to maintain and sustain innovations in the career guidance arena after external funding has finished;

(d) to foster demand-driven career guidance provision rather than supply-driven (through more systematic analysis of the real demand for services and by aiming at a service provision which fits to the size and socio-economic circumstances of the country);

(e) to gradually move towards the lifelong guidance paradigm, on which very few countries EU neighbouring countries have embarked so far (e.g. Turkey, Ukraine, Montenegro).

5.2 Other important common challenges are improved coordination and networking and how to learn from the policies and practices of comparable, neighbouring countries, and also from the EU member states and wider international experience.

(a) **Networking and coordination** have both an **internal** dimension and an **external** one. Experience shows that in many EU neighbouring countries existing services and initiatives in guidance are not well connected, and even communication with each other is often lacking. Some kind of National Forum, as currently being developed and applied in different forms by many EU member states, could provide a viable platform to improve cooperation and networking at national level through regular dialogue, exchange of information and co-operation on different aspects (materials, service delivery). Such a Forum could comprise representatives from key ministries/agencies concerned with the topic of guidance, from all providers of career guidance (including donors), practitioners as well as other stakeholders like Parents' and Students'

associations, NGOs'. Such a Forum, if well resourced, could in addition fulfil an advisory function to policy-makers.

The **external dimension** could include establishing linkages with similar networks and initiatives in other EU neighbouring countries and EU member states, with the ELGPN (European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network), Euroguidance, FEDORA (European Student Counsellors Association), and with international organisations in the guidance area, such as IAEVG (International Association of Educational and Vocational Guidance, the ICCDPP (International Centre for Career Development and Public Policy) and the bi-annual International Symposia on Career Development and Public Policy, the latest one just took place in Wellington/New Zealand in November 2009.

Enhanced networking concerns the donor-community too, to avoid a potential proliferation of fragmented initiatives and to possibly assess joint approaches between donors for funding of projects for career guidance services in the future.

- (b) **European tools and instruments.** The large stock of knowledge and expertise, tools and instruments, networks and policy documents which has been developed by the European Union as a resource for EU member states, could be also utilised by EU neighbouring countries. It could serve for reflection of their own career guidance structures and policies, but also be useful for inspiration, experimenting and testing of new policies and methods with a view to further developing a career guidance provision, which is ready to face the new challenges of the future.

## **ANNEX – Bibliography / References**

- Akkok, Fusun, *Career Guidance in the MEDA Region: Country Report on Turkey*. European Training Foundation, Turin, 2006.
- Badawi, Aboubakr Abdeen, *Career Guidance in the MEDA Region: Country Report Egypt*, European Training Foundation, Turin, 2006.
- Bardak, Ummuhan, Huitfeldt, Henrik, Wahba, Jackline, *Employment Policy Reforms in the Middle East and North Africa. Selected Issues on the Functioning of the Labour Market*, European Training Foundation, Turin, 2006.
- Bardak Ummuhan, 'An overview of educational systems and labour markets in the Mediterranean region', *Mediterranean Journal of Educational Studies*, pg. 103-125, Euro-Mediterranean Centre for Educational Research, University of Malta, 2007.
- Career Industry Council of Australia, *The public benefits of career development services. A position paper*, Career Industry Council of Australia, April 2007.
- Cedefop, *Improving lifelong guidance policies and systems. Using common European reference tools*, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 2005.
- Cedefop, *Establishing and developing national lifelong guidance policy forums: A manual for policymakers and stakeholders*, Cedefop Panorama series, 153, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 2008.
- European Commission, *Career Guidance in Europe's Public Employment Services: Trends and Challenges*. Brussels: DG Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities, 2005.
- European Commission / OECD, *Career Guidance. A Handbook for Policy Makers*. Brussels, Paris, 2005
- European Union Council, *Resolution of the Council and of the representatives of the Member States meeting within the Council on strengthening policies, systems and practices in the field of guidance throughout life in Europe*, Council of the European Union, Brussels 2004.
- European Union Council, *Council Resolution on better integrating lifelong guidance into lifelong learning strategies*, Council of the European Union, Brussels, 2008.
- Figel, Jan, 'Guidance in the knowledge society', *Opening speech at the Lifelong Guidance Policies and Systems Conference: Building the Stepping Stones*, Jyväskylä, Finland, 6-8 November 2006.
- Fretwell, David, Plant, Peter, 'Career Development Policy Models', *Synthesis Paper at the Second International Symposium on Career Development and Public Policy*, Vancouver, Canada, March 2001.
- ILO, *Career Guidance: A Resource Handbook for Low- and Middle Income Countries*. International Labour Organisation, Geneva, 2006b.
- Jarvis, Phillip S., *Career Information + Career Management Skills. Keys to a Great Career, and a Great Life*, National Life/Work Centre, Canada, 2003.
- McCarthy, John, *The skills, training and qualifications of guidance workers*, Paper prepared for the OECD Career Guidance Policy Review, Brussels, Paris, 2001.

OECD, *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, Paris, 2004.

Sultana Ronald, *Review of Career Guidance Policies in 11 Acceding and Candidate Countries. Synthesis Report*. European Training Foundation, Turin, July 2003.

Sultana, R.G., *Guidance Policies in the Knowledge Society. Trends, Challenges and Responses across Europe. A Cedefop Synthesis Report*. CEDEFOP, Thessaloniki, 2004.

Sultana, R.G., *Challenges for Career Guidance in Small States*. Malta: EMCER, 2006b.

Sultana, Ronald, Watts, A.G., *Career Guidance in the Mediterranean Region*, European Training Foundation, Turin, 2007.

Sweet Richard, *Career Guidance in the Western Balkans Region*, ETF working document, European Training Foundation, Turin, 2006.

Swisscontact, *Tracerstudy on VET graduates*, Unofficial draft, Swisscontact, Prishtina, 2008.

UNESCO, *Technical and Vocational Education and Training in the Twenty-First Century: New Roles and Challenges for Guidance and Counseling*, United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, Paris, 2002.

Watts, A.G., *Careerquake. Policy supports for self-managed careers*, Demos, London, 1998.

Watts, A.G., *Why Career Guidance Matters for Public Policy*, Paper prepared for the OECD Career Guidance Policy Review, Paris, 2002.

Watts, A.G., Fretwell, David, *Public policies for career development. Case studies and Emerging Issues for Designing Career Information and Guidance Systems in Developing and Transition Economies*. World Bank, Washington D.C., 2004.

Watts, A.G., Sultana, Ronald, Zelloth, Helmut, 'Career Guidance in the MEDA region', *Shaping Responsive TVET Systems in the MEDA Region: The Impact of a Regional Approach*. ETF Working document, Second Annual Forum of the MEDA ETE project, Rome, Turin, April 2007.

World Bank, *Investing in Turkey's Next Generation: The School-to-Work Transition and Turkey's Development*, Draft report prepared by the World Bank, Consultation version, World Bank, Washington, D.C., December 2007.

Zelloth Helmut, Gligorijevic Dragana, Sultana Ronald, 'Career Guidance Policies in Acceding and Candidate Countries', *Journal "Vocational Training: Research and Realities"*, 2003/7, Centre for Vocational Education and Research, Vytautas Magnus University, Lithuania, 2003.

Zelloth, Helmut, Visser, Tom, Van Deursen, Peter, Plant, Peter, Marijka Keupers, *Strengthening Career Guidance Policy in Bulgaria*, Peer Review Report of the CROSS/CINOP Expert Mission, Working paper, Turin, s'Hertogenbosch, Sofia, May 2007.

Zelloth Helmut, *In demand: Career guidance in EU neighbouring countries*. Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg, 2009.